



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: July 1, 2015
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of July 1, 2015**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today in at the headquarters of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) in Prague, Czech Republic. The meeting was open for public attendance as seating capacity allowed and for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Governor Matthew Armstrong
Governor Leon Aron (via telephone)
Governor Ryan Crocker
Governor Michael Kempner
Governor Karen Kornbluh (via telephone)
Governor Kenneth Weinstein
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs Richard Stengel (via telephone)

Chairman Jeffrey Shell was not in attendance.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Governor Kempner called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He noted that the meeting was being held at Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) headquarters in Prague, Czech Republic. He added that Chairman Shell was not able to attend and had asked him to preside over today's meeting.

Governor Kempner briefly commented on the Board's visit, including meetings with various RFE/RL officials and touring the facilities and learning more about the important work at RFE/RL. He expressed that all of the Governors in attendance were impressed with the work and dedication by the staff of RFE/RL in promoting the democratic values of free and open press. He noted that the Board would hear more from RFE/RL during a review of its current operations.

As the meeting in Prague celebrates two anniversaries for RFE/RL—65th anniversary since its original broadcast and 20th anniversary since its move from Munich to Prague, Governor Kempner, on behalf of the Board, thanked the Czech people and its government for their support of the United States, its people, democratic values, and RFE/RL in the past 20 years.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

Before moving to Board business, Governor Kempner brought attention to the threats that RFE/RL and other BBG journalists continue to face around the world. He acknowledged the challenges for all U.S. international media in light of increasingly oppressive governments and the rise of extremism. He highlighted the following incidents: (1) Shohret Hoshur of Radio Free Asia's (RFA) service whose three brothers are in jail in China—two are scheduled to be in court to face anti-state charges and a third was sentenced last June to five years, accused of endangering state security—for his reporting of unrest and strife in China's northwest Uyghur region; hence, the BBG joins the U.S. Department of State in requesting China to release his brothers and treat them with dignity; (2) Khadija Ismayilova, an investigative journalist for RFE/RL Azerbaijani Service, was arrested in Azerbaijan in December of 2014 and is being unjustly punished for her reporting on government corruption and human rights abuses in the country; thus, the BBG condemns the Azeri government for both the raid and closure of RFE/RL's Baku Bureau and the imprisonment of Ismayilova, calling for her immediate release; (3) In Armenia, two RFE/RL journalists were beaten by police while reporting on a standoff between the government and protestors on June 23, as well as other members of the RFE/RL team who were roughed up and detained; (4) In Tajikistan, the authorities have blocked access to RFE/RL's websites since early June, leaving little alternative to Russian media; (5) In Turkmenistan, the unprecedented intimidation campaign, including pressure on family members and public shaming, had finally forced one of RFE/RL's remaining correspondents there to quit; (6) In Burundi, a Voice of America (VOA) correspondent had a grenade thrown at her home in the capital Bujumbura, a day after she received an anonymous death threat, causing her to leave the country; (7) In Cuba, many journalists who contribute to the Martis are being arrested and harassed on a weekly basis, including three journalists were arrested on World Press Freedom Day; and (8) Bashar Fahmi, a correspondent of Alhurra, who has not been seen or heard from since he disappeared during a reporting trip in Aleppo, Syria, nearly three years ago.

Moving to Board business, Governor Kempner stated that the presence of five or more Governors satisfies the Board's quorum requirement, permitting the Board to conduct business based on majority vote. He said that the Board had received by email materials for the consent agenda, and that he did not receive comments from any Governors.

Governor Kempner described the five items on the consent agenda for the Board's consideration. Governor Crocker moved for adoption of the consent agenda. Governor Weinstein seconded.

Without objection, the consent agenda was unanimously adopted by the Board.

At Governor Kempner's invitation, Governor Armstrong, Chair of BBG Special Committee on VOA in the 21st Century, gave a brief report on his visit to Myanmar, Cambodia, and Indonesia where he met with VOA and RFA contributors, as well as other stakeholders in the region. Governor Armstrong provided highlights of his meetings, including a meeting with the President of Myanmar. He focused on three main points: (1) high demand for international media content in all three countries, especially VOA content; (2) VOA and RFA occupying different areas in the countries they cover, with limited encounters by reporters being indicative of the various projects and assignments; and (3) a better means of allocating resources as an agency. He also commented on the collaboration between VOA and RFE/RL officials in Prague.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

Andre Mendes, Interim Chief Executive Officer and Director of BBG described the efforts by U.S. international media and its affiliates to provide news and information in countries such as Russia, Burundi, Nigeria, Turkey, and Iran. He applauded all those present on the work that they do at both RFE/RL and for U.S. international media as a whole. Mr. Mendes reported the following: The continuing efforts to reform the Agency with different projects that focus on staff training and migrating into the digital age; the delay in FY 2015 budget approval which had created surpluses in some areas with the Office of Chief Financial Officer looking for ways to best reallocate those funds for mission-related activities; the status of FY 2016 budget with a proposed budget around \$30 million higher than the previous year; and the preparation of FY 2017 budget that was underway and will be submitted to the Board for its consideration in the coming months.

In accordance with the Board's prior protocol for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings, Governor Kempner invited Veronika Valdova to address the Board for three minutes.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of April 29, 2015. The Board adopted the minutes of the April 29, 2015 meeting of the plenary Board as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Resolution Honoring 65th Anniversary of RFE/RL and 20th Anniversary of Its Move to Prague, Czech Republic. The Board adopted the resolution honoring 65th anniversary of RFE/RL and 20th anniversary of its move to Prague, Czech Republic as set forth in Attachment 3.
3. Resolution Honoring Radio Marti's 30th Anniversary. The Board adopted the resolution honoring Radio Marti's 30th anniversary as set forth in Attachment 4.
4. Resolution Honoring David Ensor. The Board adopted the resolution honoring David Ensor for his service to the Voice of America as set forth in Attachment 5.
5. Resolution on Updated Policy Regarding Non-Disclosure of Deliberative Information. The Board adopted the resolution on updated policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information as set forth in Attachment 6.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: BBG Interim CEO and Director Andre Mendes; Executive Director Suzie Carroll; General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey; Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran; Kelu Chao, Acting Director of the Voice of America; Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting; John Giambalvo, Interim Manager for Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Nenad Pejic, RFE/RL Interim Manager; Ben Herman, RFE/RL General Counsel; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks; and Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

Approved:

Jeffrey Shell
Chairman

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Board Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for July 1, 2015 Board Meeting
2. Minutes of the April 29, 2015 Board Meeting
3. Resolution Honoring 65th Anniversary of RFE/RL and 20th Anniversary of Its Move to Prague, Czech Republic
4. Resolution Honoring Radio Marti's 30th Anniversary
5. Resolution Honoring David Ensor
6. Resolution on Updated Policy Regarding Non-Disclosure of Deliberative Information

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 2

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: April 29, 2015
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of April 29, 2015**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today in the Cohen Building (BBG headquarters) in Washington, D.C. The meeting was open for public attendance as seating capacity allowed and for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Jeffrey Shell
Governor Matthew Armstrong
Governor Ryan Crocker
Governor Michael Kempner
Governor Karen Kornbluh
Governor Kenneth Weinstein
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs Richard Stengel

Governor Leon Aron was not in attendance.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

The Chairman called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He stated that Governor Aron cannot be at the Board meeting as he was visiting BBG operations in Kyiv, Chisinau, and Prague.

Chairman Shell noted that the Board is continuing its search for a Chief Executive Office (CEO) following Andy Lack's resignation in March. He added that André Mendes was appointed as interim CEO and Director of BBG, and that the Board will hear later from Mr. Mendes when he gives his report to the Board. The Chairman also noted that David Ensor had announced his resignation as Director of the Voice of America (VOA) effective at the end of May. He thanked Mr. Ensor for his service as VOA's 28th Director and stated that the Board is consulting on a search for Mr. Ensor's replacement. At the Chairman's invitation, Mr. Ensor expressed his gratitude for the Board's support and his appreciation having worked at VOA.

Before starting official Board business, Chairman Shell brought attention to the threats that the BBG journalists have faced since the previous Board meeting. He noted that May 3 is World

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

Press Freedom Day, an opportunity to celebrate and defend press freedom around the world, but the global media environment is far from free. He highlighted the following incidents: (1) At the summit in Panama between United States and Cuba, TV Martí reporter Karen Caballero and Cameraman Rudy Hernandez were forced out of the press conference with Cuban foreign minister Bruno Rodriguez by the head of Cuban press security; (2) In Azerbaijan, Khadija Ismayilova, an investigative journalist and Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's contributor, remains in jail while RFE/RL's Baku bureau remains closed following a Azerbaijani Police and Prosecutor raid in December; (3) In Tikrit, the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL) ambushed an Alhurra-Iraq crew and their cameraman was shot; (4) In China, the family of a reporter of Radio Free Asia continues to be harassed; and (5) Bashar Fahmi, a reporter for Alhurra, has not been seen or heard from since he disappeared during a reporting trip in Aleppo, Syria more than two years ago. The Chairman noted that these unfortunate incidents remind BBG that the press worldwide is not free and its work is needed more than ever. He added that the work of BBG is needed to counter anti-American propaganda used by ISIL, debunk falsehoods in Russia, and provide the truth to people whose governments seek to obscure it.

Moving to Board business, the Chairman stated that the presence of five or more Governors satisfies the Board's quorum requirement, and that the Board may conduct business based on majority vote, a quorum being present. He noted that the Board had received via email materials for the consent agenda, allowing sufficient time for all Governors to review prior to this meeting, and that he did not receive comments from any Governors.

Chairman Shell described the only item for board consideration as part of the consent agenda: the minutes of February 18, 2015 meeting. Under Secretary Stengel moved for adoption of the consent agenda. Governor Kempner seconded. The consent agenda was approved unanimously by the Board.

The Chairman invited Interim CEO and Director André Mendes to give his report. Mr. Mendes began by thanking the Board for appointing him as Interim CEO and commending Mr. Ensor for his great contributions to VOA. Mr. Mendes reported that a majority of the FY 2015 budget had been approved by Congress, and that he expects the rest of the budget, including appropriation for Internet anti-censorship activities, to be approved shortly.

In accordance with the Board's prior protocol for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings, the Chairman invited Joseph Noonan, a representative of the Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting, to address the Board for three minutes.

The Board then took a short recess and reconvened for a review of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) presented by Carlos García-Pérez, OCB Director.

After the OCB review, Chairman Shell announced that the next Board meeting will be held at RFE/RL headquarters in Prague, Czech Republic on July 1, 2015. The meeting will include a review of RFE/RL. The Governors were encouraged to give input regarding other topics that they may like to see addressed at the next meeting.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

The Chairman announced that the Board will move to the VOA Briefing Room for an informal conversation with former BBG Chairman Walter Isaacson. The Chairman moved to adjourn the meeting. The Board concurred and the meeting was adjourned. This concluded the formal meeting of the BBG.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of February 18, 2015. The Board adopted the minutes of the February 18, 2015 meeting of the plenary Board as set forth in Attachment 2.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: BBG Interim CEO and Director Andre Mendes; Executive Director Suzie Carroll; Director of Global Strategy Robert Bole; General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey; Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran; Director of Public Affairs Letitia King; Michael Lamon, Management & Policy Analyst (Presidential Management Fellow); David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Kelu Chao, VOA Associate Director for Language Programming and Acting Chief of Staff; Scott Stearns, VOA Correspondent at State Department; Setareh Sieg, VOA General Manager of Persian News Network; Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB); Natalia Crujeiras, OCB Chief Content Officer; Fabian Crespo, OCB Supervisory Imaging Producer; John Giambalvo, Interim Manager for Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Ben Herman, RFE/RL General Counsel; Bernadette Burns, Radio Free Asia (RFA) General Counsel; Richard Smith, RFA Budget Director; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks; Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and Nate Rawlings, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Approved:

Jeffrey Shell
Chairman

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Board Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for April 29, 2015 Meeting
2. Minutes of the February 18, 2015 Board Meeting

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 3

RESOLUTION HONORING THE 65TH ANNIVERSARY OF RADIO FREE EUROPE/RADIO LIBERTY AND THE 20TH ANNIVERSARY OF RFE/RL'S MOVE TO PRAGUE

July 1, 2015

WHEREAS, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) was created in 1950 by the National Committee for a Free Europe with the mission to promote democratic values and institutions by broadcasting unbiased and factual information and ideas to audiences behind the communist “Iron Curtain”, and transmitted its first program to the former Czechoslovakia on July 4, 1950;

WHEREAS, many Central European and Russian leaders, including Vaclav Havel of the Czech Republic, and Boris Yeltsin of the Russian Federation, have testified to the important role RFE/RL broadcasts played in ending the Cold War;

WHEREAS, the former President of Estonia, Lennart Meri, nominated RFE/RL for the Nobel Peace Prize in 1991;

WHEREAS, Nobel laureate and former President of Poland, Lech Walesa, testified to the role played by RFE/RL in Poland's struggle for freedom when he stated that its influence “cannot even be described. Would there be earth without the sun?”;

WHEREAS, in 1995, after having played a significant role in the collapse of communism in the former Soviet Union, RFE/RL moved its content production operations from Munich, West Germany to Prague, Czech Republic in order to be closer to its audiences, as they struggled to throw off decades of totalitarian misrule and establish their place in a Europe whole and free;

WHEREAS, today, RFE/RL continues to provide news and open discussion of domestic and international issues in 28 languages to 21 countries where free and independent media are not permitted, or are not yet fully established;

WHEREAS, RFE/RL services in Iran, Iraq, Afghanistan, and Pakistan's Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province have brought their audiences information otherwise denied to them by repressive local regimes or the chaos of military conflict, and expanded the spectrum of ideas, opinions and perspectives available in the region;

WHEREAS, RFE/RL has been on the front lines in Ukraine, providing singular coverage of the Euromaidan protests, the annexation of Crimea, and the insurgency in eastern Ukraine;

WHEREAS, RFE/RL is leading the way in responding to Russia's “information war,” creating new programs on multiple media platforms that provide credible, fact-based sources of news and insight to Russian-speakers within Russia itself and in the countries that lie along Russia's periphery;

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

WHEREAS, RFE/RL is shining a spotlight throughout its broadcast region on the rise of militant Islamic extremism, the challenge to democratic governance posed by entrenched elites, and the corrosive impact of corruption on fragile societies still finding a path out from the wreckage of totalitarian rule;

WHEREAS, RFE/RL employees and freelance journalists are subject to intimidation and oppression by the authorities of regimes and by extremists in many countries to which RFE/RL broadcasts; and

WHEREAS, RFE/RL has a proven record history of promoting freedom and liberty in repressive and autocratic regimes through the creation of news content based upon the principle that the first requirement of democracy is a well-informed citizenry.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors --

1. Celebrates and commemorates the 65th anniversary of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty and the 20th anniversary of RFE/RL's move to the city of Prague in the Czech Republic;
2. Thanks the government and people of the Czech Republic for their gracious hosting of RFE/RL's broadcast headquarters and their unwavering support for RFE/RL and its mission; and
3. Applauds and thanks current and former journalists, support staff members and freelance contributors of RFE/RL for their dedication to providing credible, trustworthy, fair, and professional journalism to people denied the right of access to free and open media.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 4

RESOLUTION HONORING THE 30TH ANNIVERSARY OF RADIO MARTI

July 1, 2015

WHEREAS, Radio Martí (the Martí) began broadcasting to Cuba on May 20, 1985, to provide accurate, balanced and comprehensive news and information to the Cuban people;

WHEREAS, Radio Martí has served for three decades as a vital communications link to the Cuban people in support of freedom and democracy during economic, cultural and political hardships and a trusted source of news during a period of dynamic changes in U.S.-Cuba relations;

WHEREAS, the Martí have successfully adopted television, online and mobile platforms to reach new audiences in Cuba;

WHEREAS, Radio Martí continues to be a unique source of uncensored news and information for Cubans about U.S. official policy, commentary and expert analysis on Cuba, the struggle for human rights, immigration reform, and the mounting desire for private entrepreneurship on the island;

WHEREAS, the Martí are a unique source of information for Cubans about American society as well as American achievements in business, medicine, science, technology and the arts, which can serve as an inspiration and a model for a future Cuba;

WHEREAS, the Martí have nurtured and developed successful distribution networks with local and national Spanish-language radio and television networks such as Radio Caracol, SiriusXM, MegaTV and MiraTV;

WHEREAS, the Martí are a respected source of objective and accurate information about Cuba, the Caribbean region, the United States and the rest of the world, with a major focus on political developments and the Cuban people's aspirations to end their isolation in the hemisphere;

WHEREAS, Radio Martí continues to broadcast lifesaving news and information to Cuba drawing from the largest network of independent journalist and citizen reporters on the island;

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved by the Broadcasting Board of Governors that we celebrate and commemorate the 30th anniversary of Radio Martí.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Broadcasting Board of Governors commends and congratulates both the current and former members of the Radio Martí staff and all other Martí platforms for their dedication to fostering open communication of information and ideas between the people of Cuba and the United States.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 5

RESOLUTION HONORING DAVID ENSOR

July 1, 2015

WHEREAS, David Ensor has served as the 28th Director of the Voice of America (VOA) from June 2011 through May 2015;

WHEREAS, David Ensor has overseen dramatic audience gains across diverse delivery platforms including new television programming in Russian, Ukrainian, Persian, Mandarin, Burmese, Urdu, Kurdish, Pashto, Somali, Dari, Creole, and English;

WHEREAS, David Ensor has initiated a “digital first” reorganization of VOA’s central newsroom to better meet the portable, immediate, and interactive demands of the tech-savvy leaders of tomorrow;

WHEREAS, David Ensor has helped boost programming to Africa including countering violent extremism and covering the Ebola crisis in a ground-breaking partnership with the British Broadcasting Corporation; and

WHEREAS, David Ensor has been a tireless defender of the VOA Charter demanding “accurate, objective, and comprehensive” news.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors hereby expresses its great appreciation and gratitude for David Ensor’s outstanding performance and invaluable contributions in furtherance of the mission of U.S. international media.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to David Ensor.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 6

RESOLUTION ON POLICY REGARDING NON-DISCLOSURE OF DELIBERATIVE INFORMATION

July 1, 2015

WHEREAS, the faith and trust of the American people in the integrity of government institutions is critical to the proper functioning of the Federal Government;

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors believes that a culture of ethical behavior is a necessary foundational element to a reputation for honesty, objectivity, and impartiality;

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors recognizes that all agency employees must place loyalty to the Constitution, laws and regulations promulgated under its authority, and ethical principles applicable to the Executive Branch above private gain;

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors recognizes the obligation of all Federal employees to ensure nonpublic Government information is not improperly used to further any private interest;

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors recognizes that Federal employees shall not use their public office for private gain;

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors understands that the full and open exchange of nonpublic Government information between individual employees is essential to the effective management and operation of the agency; and

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors understands that the unauthorized disclosure or dissemination of nonpublic Government information is deleterious to the effective management and operation of the agency and can cause substantial harm to public interests.

IT IS HEREBY RESOLVED THAT:

The Board of Governors shall respect and preserve the security and confidentiality of nonpublic agency information, deliberations, and decisions to the utmost of its ability. Individual Members of the Board agree to not use nonpublic agency information for their own purposes, or to advance the private interests of any other person or entity.

The Board of Governors strives to conduct official agency business in as open and transparent a manner as possible. In doing so, individual Members of the Board agree that decisions to release agency nonpublic information, deliberations, or decisions shall be made collectively by the Board, or by agency employees when so delegated, in accordance with applicable laws, regulations, and established agency policies.

Minutes of July 1, 2015 Meeting

Members of the Board retain the right to fully express individual opinions on any agency matter while performing official duties, and to question or challenge other Members when they believe it is necessary to the effective management and operation of the agency.

Members of the Board of Governors shall respect the confidentiality of their nonpublic discussions with other Members at all times and shall not disclose their existence or substance of without the express consent of the Members concerned unless otherwise authorized to do so by law or regulation.

Nothing in this policy restricts the rights of individual Members of the Board to discuss any matter of official agency business with other Executive Branch employees for official government purposes, or to disclose any instance of fraud, waste, abuse, or similar illegal or improper activity to the Office of the Inspector General or other appropriate law enforcement agency, department, or office.

Potential violations of this policy may be brought to the attention of any Member of the Board or the Board's Secretary. Conduct suspected of violating this policy will be discussed at the next scheduled Board meeting; Board discussions regarding potential violations may be conducted in sessions closed to the public if necessary. Members of the Board found to have violated this policy are subject to public censure by the Board, removal from leadership positions or committee assignments, restriction of access to nonpublic agency information, and, if warranted, referral to the U.S. Department of Justice.